

STATE OF MICHIGAN
WAYNE COUNTY CIRCUIT COURT

KELLY GOTTESMAN,
individually, and as representative
of a class of similarly-situated persons
and entities,

Case No. 17-014341-CZ
Hon. Susan L. Hubbard

Plaintiff,

v.

CITY OF HARPER WOODS,
a Michigan municipal corporation,

Defendant.

Gregory D. Hanley (P51204)
Jamie Warrow (P61521)
Edward F. Kickham Jr. (P70332)
Kickham Hanley PLLC
32121 Woodward Avenue, Suite 300
Royal Oak, MI 48073
(248) 544-1500
Attorneys for Plaintiff and the Class

Joseph W. Colaianne (P72419)
Ronald A. King (P45088)
Bethany G. Stawasz (P75578)
Clark Hill PLLC
212 East Cesar E. Chavez Ave.
Lansing, MI 48906
(517) 318-3100
Attorneys for Defendant

Marc N. Drasnin (P36682)
Joelson Rosenberg et al
30665 Northwestern Hwy Ste 200
Farmington Hills, MI 48334
(248) 855-3088
Co-counsel for Plaintiff and the Class

Sharon A. DeWaele (P43712)
O'Reilly Rancilio, P.C.
12900 Hall Road, Suite 350
Sterling Heights, MI 48313
(586) 997-6470
Attorneys for Defendant

STIPULATED ORDER AUTHORIZING CLASS NOTICE

At a session of the Wayne County Circuit Court
held in the City of Detroit, State of Michigan
on this 29th day of June, 2018

PRESENT: HON. JUDGE SUSAN L. HUBBARD
Circuit Court Judge

17-014341-CZ FILED IN MY OFFICE Cathy M. Garrett WAYNE COUNTY CLERK 6/29/2018 11:34 AM Gaylynn Brooks-Williams

This matter having come before the Court upon the stipulation of the parties for entry of an order authorizing the parties to provide notice of the pendency of this action to the members of the class, and the Court being otherwise advised in these premises:

WHEREAS, on March 22, 2018, the Court entered an order certifying a class consisting of all persons and entities who paid or incurred the City of Harper Woods' (the "City") mandatory stormwater service charge (the "Stormwater Charge") the City imposes on owners of real property (a) at any time after September 28, 2016 (as to Count I of Plaintiff's Complaint) and/or (b) at any time after September 28, 2011 (as to Counts II through VII of Plaintiff's Complaint). The time periods set by the Court are solely for purposes of defining potentially eligible class members.

WHEREAS, MCR 3.501(C) states that "[n]otice shall be given as provided in this subrule to persons who are included in a class action by certification ...", and requires that the Court "determine how, when, by whom, and to whom the notice shall be given; the content of the notice; and to whom the response to the notice is to be sent."

WHEREAS, the parties have agreed that the form of the Notice attached to this Order as Exhibit 1 complies with the requirements of MCR 3.501;

WHEREAS, the City has maintained records in electronic format sufficient to provide the service addresses of the class members who are current water and sewer customers, and shall provide those records to Plaintiff's counsel, in electronic format, within 14 days of the entry of this Order so that Plaintiff's counsel can provide notice to the class members via first class U.S. mail; and

WHEREAS, the parties have stipulated to further provide for the publishing of the summary Notice attached as Exhibit 2 in the Detroit Free Press newspaper on two occasions prior to July 15, 2018.

Pursuant to the parties' stipulation, and the Court being fully advised in the premises:

IT IS ORDERED that, within 14 days of the entry of this Order, the City shall provide to Plaintiff's counsel records in electronic format sufficient to provide the service addresses of the class members who are current water and sewer customers so that Plaintiff's counsel can provide notice to the class members via first class U.S. mail.

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that, within 21 days of Plaintiff's counsel's receipt of the records identified above, Plaintiff shall disseminate the Notice attached as Exhibit 1 to this Order to the members of the class identified as current water and sewer customers in the City's records via U.S. mail.

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED THAT Plaintiff shall arrange for the publication of the Notice attached as Exhibit 2 to this Order in the Detroit Free Press newspaper on two occasions prior to July 15, 2018.

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED THAT any class member who does not serve a notice of intent to be excluded from the class on or before August 20, 2018 will be bound by the judgment entered in this case.

/s/ Susan Hubbard 6/29/2018

Circuit Court Judge

STIPULATED AND AGREED:

KICKHAM HANLEY PLLC

By: /s/ Gregory D. Hanley
Gregory D. Hanley (P51204)
Jamie K. Warrow (P61521)
Edward F. Kickham Jr. (P70332)
32121 Woodward Avenue, Suite 300
Royal Oak, Michigan 48073
(248) 544-1500
Attorneys for Plaintiff

O'REILLY RANCILIO P.C.

By: /s/Sharon A. DeWaele (w/consent)
Sharon A. DeWaele (P43712)
12900 Hall Road, Suite 350
Sterling Heights, MI 48313
(586) 997-6470
Attorneys for Defendant

CLARK HILL PLC

By: /s/Ronald A. King (w/consent)
Ronald A. King (P45088)
212 East Cesar E. Chavez Ave.
Lansing, MI 48906
(517) 318-3100
Attorneys for Defendant

EXHIBIT - 1

STATE OF MICHIGAN
WAYNE COUNTY CIRCUIT COURT

KELLY GOTTESMAN,
individually, and as representative
of a class of similarly-situated persons
and entities,

Case No. 17-014341-CZ
Hon. Susan L. Hubbard

Plaintiff,

v.

CITY OF HARPER WOODS,
a Michigan municipal corporation,

Defendant.

Gregory D. Hanley (P51204)
Jamie Warrow (P61521)
Edward F. Kickham Jr. (P70332)
Kickham Hanley PLLC
32121 Woodward Avenue, Suite 300
Royal Oak, MI 48073
(248) 544-1500
Attorneys for Plaintiff and the Class

Joseph W. Colaianne (P72419)
Ronald A. King (P45088)
Bethany G. Stawasz (P75578)
Clark Hill PLLC
212 East Cesar E. Chavez Ave.
Lansing, MI 48906
(517) 318-3100
Attorneys for Defendant

Marc N. Drasnin (P36682)
Joelson Rosenberg et al
30665 Northwestern Hwy Ste 200
Farmington Hills, MI 48334
(248) 855-3088
Co-counsel for Plaintiff and the Class

Sharon A. DeWaele (P43712)
O'Reilly Rancilio, P.C.
12900 Hall Road, Suite 350
Sterling Heights, MI 48313
(586) 997-6470
Attorneys for Defendant

**LEGAL NOTICE
NOTICE OF CLASS ACTION**

TO: All persons and entities which have paid the City of Harper Woods (the "City") for stormwater disposal services at any time after September 28, 2011.

An action has been commenced in the 3rd Judicial Circuit Court (Wayne County) titled *Gottesman v. City of Harper Woods*, Case No. 17-014341-CZ, presiding Judge Susan L. Hubbard, challenging mandatory stormwater service charges (the "Stormwater Charges") the City imposes upon owners of real property. Plaintiff brought these claims on behalf of himself and a class of all others similarly situated.

Plaintiff is an individual who owns property in the City and who has paid the Stormwater Charges imposed by the City. Plaintiff contends that: (a) the Stormwater Charges are not proper user fees, but taxes wrongfully imposed by the City to raise revenue in violation of the Headlee Amendment to the Michigan constitution of 1963; (b) the Stormwater Charges violate the Prohibited Taxes By Cities And

Villages Act, MCL 141.91 because the Stormwater Charges are not ad valorem taxes, but are taxes imposed, levied, or collected after January 1, 1964; (c) the Stormwater Charges are unlawful because they are unreasonable; (d) the Stormwater Charges violate the City's own ordinances because they exceed the total costs of the debt retirement and operation and maintenance of the stormwater system; (e) the City has been unjustly enriched by the collection and retention of the Stormwater Charges and/or is required to refund the Stormwater Charges under a theory of assumpsit; and (f) that Plaintiff and those similarly situated have been harmed by the City's collection and retention of the Stormwater Charges.

Plaintiff seeks a judgment from the Court against the City that would order and direct the City to refund all Stormwater Charges to which Plaintiffs and the class are entitled and any other appropriate relief. The City maintains that the City's imposition of the Stormwater is proper and not unlawful. The City contends that it should prevail in the lawsuit. The Court has made no rulings concerning the merits of the lawsuit at this time.

On March 22, 2018, Judge Hubbard entered an Opinion and Order certifying the lawsuit as a class action. You are receiving this notice because the City's records indicate that an individual or entity owning or residing at this property address paid the City's stormwater service charges at some time after September 28, 2011 and is, therefore, a member of the class.

On June 7, 2018, Judge Hubbard granted Plaintiff's motion for partial summary disposition as to Count I of Plaintiff's Complaint, Violation of the Headlee Amendment.

No financial consequences will be suffered by class members if Plaintiffs lose. However, if Plaintiff loses, all class members will be barred from bringing an individual action against the City alleging the claims contained in Plaintiff's complaint.

The City has not filed a counterclaim against Plaintiff or the class.

If you paid or incurred the City's stormwater service charges at any time between September 28, 2011 to present, then you are a member of the class.

If you are a member of the class, you are bound by any judgment entered in this action, whether the judgment is favorable or unfavorable to the class, unless you exclude yourself from the lawsuit.

Class members who wish to exclude themselves from the lawsuit may write to class counsel, stating that they do not wish to participate in the lawsuit and that they wish to retain their right to file a separate action against the City. **This request for exclusion must be postmarked no later than August 20, 2018 and mailed to: Kickham Hanley PLLC, 32121 Woodward Avenue, Royal Oak, Michigan 48073.**

Whether to remain a member of this class or to request exclusion from this class action to attempt to pursue a separate lawsuit at your own expense without the assistance of the Plaintiff in this lawsuit is a question you should ask your own attorney. Class counsel cannot and will not advise you on this issue.

If you are a class member, you have the right to intervene in this action as a named party. If you choose to intervene, you may become liable for costs and will have similar rights and responsibilities as Plaintiff. Further, you may have counsel of your own choosing and class counsel will not be obligated to represent you.

For a more detailed statement of the matters involved in the lawsuit, you may inspect the lawsuit documents during regular business hours at the Office of the Clerk for the 3rd Judicial Circuit Court (Wayne County) at 2 Woodward Ave., Detroit, MI 48226. You may also find additional information concerning the lawsuit at www.kickhamhanley.com.

Should you have any questions with respect to this notice you should raise them with your own attorney or direct them to counsel for the class, **IN WRITING OR BY EMAIL, NOT BY TELEPHONE**, to the attorneys for Plaintiffs and the class, below. **DO NOT CONTACT THE COURT OR CLERK OF THE COURT, OR ATTORNEYS FOR DEFENDANT.**

Attorneys for Plaintiff and the class:

Gregory D. Hanley (P51204)
Jamie Warrow (P61521)
Edward F. Kickham Jr. (P70332)
KICKHAM HANLEY PLLC.
32121 Woodward Avenue, Suite 300
Royal Oak, Michigan 48073
khtemp@kickhamhanley.com

KH155224

EXHIBIT - 2

LEGAL NOTICE

NOTICE OF CLASS ACTION

TO: All persons and entities which have paid the City of Harper Woods (the “City”) for water and sanitary sewage disposal services at any time after September 28, 2011.

An action has been commenced in the 3rd Judicial Circuit Court (Wayne County) titled *Gottesman v. City of Harper Woods*, Case No. 17-014341-CZ, presiding Judge Susan L. Hubbard, challenging mandatory stormwater service charges (the “Stormwater Charges”) the City imposes upon owners of real property. Plaintiff brought these claims on behalf of himself and a class of all others similarly situated.

Plaintiff is an individual who owns property in the City and who has paid the Stormwater Charges imposed by the City. Plaintiff contends that: (a) the Stormwater Charges are not proper user fees, but taxes wrongfully imposed by the City to raise revenue in violation of the Headlee Amendment to the Michigan constitution of 1963; (b) the Stormwater Charges violate the Prohibited Taxes By Cities And Villages Act, MCL 141.91 because the Stormwater Charges are not ad valorem taxes, but are taxes imposed, levied, or collected after January 1, 1964; (c) the Stormwater Charges are unlawful because they are unreasonable; (d) the Stormwater Charges violate the City’s own ordinances because they exceed the total costs of the debt retirement and operation and maintenance of the stormwater system; (e) the City has been unjustly enriched by the collection and retention of the Stormwater Charges and/or is required to refund the Stormwater Charges under a theory of assumpsit; and (f) that Plaintiff and those similarly situated have been harmed by the City’s collection and retention of the Stormwater Charges.

Plaintiff seeks a judgment from the Court against the City that would order and direct the City to refund all Stormwater Charges to which Plaintiffs and the class are entitled and any other appropriate relief. The City maintains that the City’s imposition of the Stormwater is proper and not unlawful. The City contends that it should prevail in the lawsuit. The Court has made no rulings concerning the merits of the lawsuit at this time.

On March 22, 2018, Judge Hubbard entered an Opinion and Order certifying the lawsuit as a class action. In addition to mailing notices to individuals or entities whom the City’s records indicate paid the City’s Stormwater Charges at some time after September 28, 2011, Plaintiff has caused this notice to be published in order to provide an additional form of notice to class members. On June 7, 2018, Judge Hubbard granted Plaintiff’s motion for partial summary disposition as to Count I of Plaintiff’s Complaint, Violation of the Headlee Amendment.

For a more detailed statement of the matters involved in the Lawsuit and the rights of the class members, including the right to exclude themselves by providing notice of such exclusion by August 20, 2018, you are referred to papers on file in the Lawsuit, which may be inspected during regular business hours at the Office of the Clerk of Circuit Court for Wayne County, Michigan. You also may review certain documents of the Lawsuit at www.kickhamhanley.com.

Should you have any questions with respect to this Notice you should raise them with your own attorney or direct them to counsel for the Class, **IN WRITING OR BY EMAIL, NOT BY TELEPHONE**, identified as Attorneys for Plaintiff and the Class, below. **DO NOT CONTACT THE COURT OR CLERK OF THE COURT, OR ATTORNEYS FOR DEFENDANT.**

Attorneys for Plaintiff and the Class:

Gregory D. Hanley (P51204)
Jamie Warrow (P61521)
Edward F. Kickham Jr. (P70332)
KICKHAM HANLEY PLLC
32121 Woodward Avenue, Suite 300
Royal Oak, MI 48073
khtemp@kickhamhanley.com

KH155225

Kim Plets

From: info@truefiling.com
Sent: Thursday, June 28, 2018 12:21 PM
To: Kim Plets
Subject: TrueFiling: Service Notification - MI Wayne 3rd Circuit Court - Case No. 17-014341-CZ

The following document(s) listed below are being electronically served to you for case **17-014341-CZ** by **Edward Kickham** from the **MI Wayne 3rd Circuit Court**.

• Document Title: Order/judgment accepted-waiting for judge's signature

Link: [Click to download document](#)

Or Copy and Paste: <https://mifile.courts.michigan.gov/openfiling/905b3e29-f3ec-42f3-dea5-08d5d0a5788e/recipient/f6192be2-82cd-4b05-381f-08d5d0a58021/download>

The following people were electronically served the above document(s):

- Marc Drasnin (MDRASNIN@JOELSONROSENBERG.COM)
- SHARON DE WAELE-PERSICHINI (SDEWAELE@ORLAW.COM)
- Bethany Stawasz (BStawasz@clarkhill.com)
- Gregory Hanley (GHANLEY@KICKHAMHANLEY.COM)
- Stacy Czech (sczech@clarkhill.com)
- Kimberly Plets (kplets@kickhamhanley.com)
- Jacqueline Nicholson (jnicholson@clarkhill.com)
- Kinneitha Thomas (kthomas@clarkhill.com)
- Ronald King (RKing@clarkhill.com)
- Joseph Colaianne (jcolaianne@clarkhill.com)
- Jamie Warrow (jwarrow@kickhamhanley.com)
- Edward Kickham (ekickhamjr@kickhamhanley.com)
- Lauren McPartlin (lmepartlin@clarkhill.com)

Thank you,

MI Wayne 3rd Circuit Court

***** This email was sent from an unattended email mailbox - replies to this email will be rejected *****

About TrueFiling

TrueFiling is a 24x7 Web-based e-file and e-service solution for courts, law firms and self-represented filers. It expedites justice by reducing paper handling and travel time and improves the court's internal processes through electronic workflow.

Home page: <https://mifile.courts.michigan.gov/>

Copyright 2018, ImageSoft, Inc.

CONFIDENTIALITY NOTICE: This message and any attached documents may contain confidential information from MI Wayne 3rd Circuit Court. The information is intended only for the use of the individual or entity named above. If the reader of this message is not the intended recipient, or an employee or agent responsible for the delivery of this message to the intended recipient, the reader is hereby notified that any dissemination, distribution or copying of this message or of any attached documents, or the taking of any action or omission to take any action in reliance on the contents of this message or of any attached documents, is strictly prohibited. If you have received this communication in error, please delete the message immediately.